

March 30, 2023

<u>VIA EMAIL AND CERTIFIED MAIL</u> RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

Max Maxfield

Cheyenne, WY 82009

RE: MUR 8047

Charles Gray, et al.

Dear Mr. Maxfield:

On March 28, 2023, the Federal Election Commission reviewed the allegations in your complaint dated August 3, 2022, and found that on the basis of the information provided in your complaint, and information provided by the respondents, that there is (1) no reason to believe that Charles Gray violated 52 U.S.C. § 30122 or 11 C.F.R. § 110.4 by permitting his name to be used to effect contributions in the name of another or 52 U.S.C. § 30116(f) or 11 C.F.R. § 110.9 by knowingly accepting excessive contributions; (2) no reason to believe that Citizens for Chuck Gray and Jean Kordenbrock in her official capacity as treasurer violated 52 U.S.C. § 30122 or 11 C.F.R. § 110.4 by knowingly accepting contributions made in the name of another or 52 U.S.C. § 30116(f) or 11 C.F.R. § 110.9 by knowingly accepting excessive contributions; and (3) no reason to believe that Jan Charles Gray violated 52 U.S.C. § 30122 or 11 C.F.R. § 110.4 by making contributions in the name of another or 52 U.S.C. § 30116(a) or 11 C.F.R. § 110.1(b) by making excessive contributions. Specifically, the Commission found that the source of Charles Gray's loans to his principal campaign committee were his personal funds. Accordingly, on March 28, 2023, the Commission closed the file in this matter.

Documents related to the case will be placed on the public record within 30 days. *See* Disclosure of Certain Documents in Enforcement and Other Matters, 81 Fed. Reg. 50,702 (Aug. 2, 2016). The Factual and Legal Analysis, which explains the Commission's findings, is enclosed for your information.

MUR804700049

MUR 8047 (Charles Gray, *et al.*) Max Maxfield Page 2

The Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971, as amended, allows a complainant to seek judicial review of the Commission's dismissal of this action. See 52 U.S.C. § 30109(a)(8).

Sincerely,

Lisa J. Stevenson Acting General Counsel

Mark Shonkwiler

BY: Mark Shonkwiler

Assistant General Counsel

Enclosure Factual and Legal Analysis

1 FEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION 2 FACTUAL AND LEGAL ANALYSIS 3 **RESPONDENTS:** Charles Gray **MUR 8047** 4 Citizens for Chuck Gray and Jean Kordenbrock 5 in her official capacity as treasurer 6 Jan Charles Gray 7 I. INTRODUCTION 8 Charles Gray, a 2022 candidate for Wyoming's at-large congressional district, reportedly 9 loaned \$298,318 of his personal funds to his principal campaign committee, Citizens for Chuck Gray and Jean Kordenbrock in her official capacity as treasurer (the "Committee"). Relying on 10 11 Gray's financial disclosure reports to the House of Representatives, which were submitted after 12 the loans were issued, the Complaint argues that Gray lacked adequate income and assets to loan the Committee \$298,318.² The Complaint alleges that Gray's father, Jan Charles Gray, likely 13 14 provided the funds as he is an owner of a radio broadcasting station and contributed \$200,000 to an independent expenditure-only political committee ("IEPOC") that supported Gray.³ The 15

FEC Receipts: Filtered Results, FEC.GOV, https://www.fec.gov/data/receipts/?data_type=processed &committee_id=C00771071&contributor_name=charles+gray&two_year_transaction_period=2022 (last visited Feb. 16, 2023) (reflecting contributions from Gray to the Committee during the 2022 election cycle); Citizens for Chuck Gray, Amended Statement of Organization at 2-3 (Apr. 6, 2021), https://docquery.fec.gov/pdf/876/2021 04069443069876/202104069443069876.pdf; Charles Gray, Statement of Candidacy (Mar. 1, 2021), https://docquery.fec.gov/pdf/633/202103019429233633/202103019429233633.pdf.

Complaint thus alleges that the candidate loans of \$298,318 were actually contributions from

16

Compl. at 1-2 (Aug. 3, 2022); see also Financial Disclosure Report, CLERK OF H.R. (May 16, 2022), https://disclosures-clerk.house.gov/public_disc/financial-pdfs/2022/10048920.pdf (reflecting Gray's reported income from January 1, 2021, through April 30, 2022, and assets as of April 30, 2022); Financial Disclosure Report, CLERK OF H.R. (Aug. 13, 2021), https://disclosures-clerk.house.gov/public_disc/financial-pdfs/2021/10039676.pdf (reflecting Gray's reported income from January 1, 2020, through July 20, 2021, and assets as of July 20, 2021).

Compl. at 2-4; see also FEC Protect Wyoming Values PAC: Raising, FEC.gov, https://www.fec.gov/data/committee/C00777524/?tab=raising (last visited Feb. 16, 2023) (reflecting that the only receipts received by the IEOPC Protect Wyoming Values PAC were two \$100,000 contributions from Jan Charles Gray).

MUR 8047 (Charles Gray, et al.) Factual and Legal Analysis Page 2 of 7

- 1 Gray's father, made in the name of another, and that these contributions exceed the individual
- 2 contribution limit.⁴
- In a joint response from Gray and the Committee, Gray represents that the source of the
- 4 funds underlying the loans was a 2017 liquidation of a trust, which predated the time period
- 5 covered by the House financial disclosure reports relied on by the Complaint, and a 2021
- 6 inheritance from his grandfather, Siegfried C. Ringwald, who died on December 19, 2020.⁵
- 7 Citing the House Ethics Committee's instruction guide on filing financial disclosure reports,
- 8 Gray states that he did not report the inheritance on the financial disclosure reports because
- 9 inheritances are not required to be reported.⁶ The instruction guide also provides that interest-
- free loans owed to the candidate are not required to be reported.⁷
- Because there is no evidence contrary to Gray's assertion that the source of the loans was
- 12 a liquidation of a trust and an inheritance from his grandfather, and the House financial
- disclosure reports relied on by the Complaint are not required to include inheritances or interest-
- free loans owed to the candidate and only reflect Gray's assets after he already made the loans to
- the Committee, the Commission finds: (1) no reason to believe that Gray violated 52 U.S.C.
- 16 § 30122 or 11 C.F.R. § 110.4 by permitting his name to be used to effect contributions in the
- 17 name of another or 52 U.S.C. § 30116(f) or 11 C.F.R. § 110.9 by knowingly accepting excessive

⁴ Compl. at 4.

⁵ Charles Gray & Citizens for Chuck Gray Resp. at 2-3 (Oct. 20, 2022) (hereinafter "Resp."). Jan Charles Gray did not submit a response.

Resp. at 3 (citing *Financial Disclosure Statements and Periodic Transaction Reports*, H.R. COMM. ON ETHICS at 29 (2021), https://ethics.house.gov/sites/ethics.house.gov/files/documents/FINAL%202021%20FD%20 Instructions 0.pdf).

Financial Disclosure Statements and Periodic Transaction Reports, H.R. COMM. ON ETHICS at 22, 24 (2021), https://ethics.house.gov/sites/ethics.house.gov/files/documents/FINAL%202021%20FD%20Instructions_0.pdf.

MUR 8047 (Charles Gray, et al.) Factual and Legal Analysis Page 3 of 7

- 1 contributions; (2) no reason to believe that the Committee violated 52 U.S.C. § 30122 or
- 2 11 C.F.R. § 110.4 by knowingly accepting contributions made in the name of another or
- 3 52 U.S.C. § 30116(f) or 11 C.F.R. § 110.9 by knowingly accepting excessive contributions; and
- 4 (3) no reason to believe that Jan Charles Gray violated 52 U.S.C. § 30122 or 11 C.F.R. § 110.4
- 5 by making contributions in the name of another or 52 U.S.C. § 30116(a) or 11 C.F.R. § 110.1(b)
- 6 by making excessive contributions.

7

II. FACTUAL BACKGROUND

- From approximately March 1, 2021, to September 14, 2021, Gray was a candidate for
- 9 Wyoming's at-large congressional district. 8 Gray subsequently ran for Wyoming's Secretary of
- State and was elected to that position on November 8, 2022.9
- The Committee's disclosure reports provide that, between February 21, 2021, and
- June 30, 2021, Gray loaned \$298,318 of his personal funds to the Committee. ¹⁰ The bulk of the
- loans consists of a \$125,000 loan dated March 31, 2021, and a \$165,000 loan dated June 30,
- 14 2021. 11 Gray did not charge interest on any of the loans. 12
- On August 13, 2021, Gray disclosed to the Clerk of the House of Representatives that, in
- 16 2020, he had an income of \$31,120 to \$31,920, and that from January 1, 2021, to July 20, 2021,

Charles Gray, Statement of Candidacy (Mar. 1, 2021), https://docquery.fec.gov/pdf/633/202103019429233633/202103019429233633.pdf; Resp. at 3 (explaining that Gray announced his candidacy on March 4, 2021, and suspended his campaign on September 14, 2021).

⁹ Wyoming Secretary of State Election Results, N.Y. TIMES (Nov. 9, 2022), https://www.nytimes.com/ interactive/2022/11/08/us/elections/results-wyoming-secretary-of-state.html.

Citizens for Chuck Gray, 2022 October Quarterly Report at 9-20 (Oct. 15, 2022), https://docquery.fec.gov/pdf/735/202210159532683735/202210159532683735.pdf (reflecting the loans the Committee owes to Gray, none of which have been paid back).

¹¹ *Id.* at 18-20.

Id. at 9-20. Gray made 10 other loans to the Committee from February 16, 2021, to June 30, 2021, totaling \$8,318. FEC Receipts: Filtered Results, FEC.GOV, https://www.fec.gov/data/receipts/?committee_id=C00771071 https://www.fec.gov/data/receipts/?committee_id=C00771071 https://www.fec.gov/data/receipts/?committee_id=C00771071 https://www.fec.gov/data/receipts/?committee_id=C00771071 https://www.fec.gov/data/receipts/?committee_id=C00771071 https://www.fec.gov/data/teceipts/?committee_id=C00771071 htt

MUR804700053

MUR 8047 (Charles Gray, et al.) Factual and Legal Analysis Page 4 of 7

- he had an income \$19,624 to \$29,623. 13 Gray also disclosed that, as of July 20, 2021, he had a
- 2 total of \$146,006 to \$416,000 in assets. 14 No other transactions were disclosed.
- 3 Subsequently, on May 16, 2022, Gray disclosed to the Clerk of the House of
- 4 Representatives that, in 2021, he had an income of \$14,305 to \$24,304, and that from January 1,
- 5 2022, to April 30, 2022, he had an income of \$16,150 to \$26,149. To Gray also disclosed that, as
- of April 30, 2022, he had a total of \$147,006 to \$430,000 in assets. No other transactions were
- 7 disclosed.
- 8 In the Response, however, Gray states that he received two sums of money totaling
- 9 \$800,000 from his grandfather, Siegfried C. Ringwald, who passed away on December 19, 2020,
- and that these were the source of the loans he made to the Committee. ¹⁷ Specifically, Gray
- received approximately \$250,000 from a family trust liquidated in 2017 that was set up by his
- grandfather in 2017 or earlier, which predated the time period covered by the House financial
- disclosure reports, and that this was the source of the \$125,000 loaned to the Committee on
- March 30, 2021. Subsequently, between May 28, 2021, and June 1, 2021, Gray received
- approximately \$550,000 from the liquidation of his grandfather's testamentary estate according
- to his grandfather's will, and this was the source of the \$165,000 loaned to the Committee on

Financial Disclosure Report, CLERK OF H.R. (Aug. 13, 2021), https://disclosures-clerk.house.gov/public_disc/financial-pdfs/2021/10039676.pdf (reflecting Gray's reported income from January 1, 2020, through July 20, 2021, and assets as of July 20, 2021).

¹⁴ *Id*.

Financial Disclosure Report, CLERK OF H.R. (May 16, 2022), https://disclosures-clerk.house.gov/public_disc/financial-pdfs/2022/10048920.pdf (reflecting Gray's reported income from January 1, 2021, through April 30, 2022, and assets as of April 30, 2022)

^{16 14}

Resp. at 2-3; see Tammye McDuff, Dean of Long Beach City College and President of Cerritos College, La Mirada Lamplighter 2020 (Jan. 1, 2021), http://lmlamplighter.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/LM_1_01_21_w.pdf (only one page was available) (reflecting that Mr. Ringwald passed away on December 19, 2020).

¹⁸ Resp. at 2.

MUR 8047 (Charles Gray, *et al.*) Factual and Legal Analysis Page 5 of 7

- June 30, 2021. 19 Gray states that he did not disclose the inheritance that he received in 2021 on
- 2 the House financial disclosure reports because inheritances are not required to be reported
- 3 according to the House Ethics Committee. 20

III. LEGAL ANALYSIS

4

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

5 A. The Commission Finds No Reason to Believe that the Underlying Source of the Candidate Loans were not Gray's Personal Funds

During the 2021-2022 election cycle, individuals were limited to making \$2,900 in contributions to each candidate per election.²¹ An exception to this rule is that a candidate may make unlimited contributions to his or her own principal campaign committee from his or her personal funds.²² Personal funds include, among other things, assets that the candidate had "legal right of access to or control over" and either "[l]egal and rightful title" or "[a]n equitable interest" when the individual became a candidate, ²³ and income received during the election cycle of the candidacy, including "[b]equests to the candidate."²⁴ In addition, when making a

contribution, "[n]o person shall make a contribution in the name of another person or knowingly

¹⁹ *Id.* at 3.

Id. (citing Financial Disclosure Statements and Periodic Transaction Reports, H.R. COMM. ON ETHICS at 29 (2021), https://ethics.house.gov/sites/ethics.house.gov/files/documents/FINAL%202021%20FD%20Instructions_0.pdf). Gray also states that "he personally consulted with House Ethics personnel who confirmed for him that this inheritance was not reportable." Id.

²¹ 52 U.S.C. § 30116(a)(1), (f); 11 C.F.R. §§ 110.1(b)(1), 110.9; *Contribution limits for 2021-2022*, FEC.GOV, https://www.fec.gov/updates/contribution-limits-2021-2022/ (last visited Feb. 16, 2023).

²² 11 C.F.R. § 110.10; see also Buckley v. Valeo, 424 U.S. 1, 54 (1976) (holding that the Act's "restriction on a candidate's personal expenditures is unconstitutional" as to his own campaign).

²³ 11 C.F.R. § 100.33(a).

Id. § 100.33(b)(3). Income received during the election cycle of the candidacy that is also considered personal funds include salary and earned income from bona fide employment; income from stocks or investments or liquidation of such stocks or investments; income from trusts established before the beginning of the election cycle; income from trusts established by bequest after the beginning of the election cycle of which the candidate is a beneficiary; gifts of a personal nature that had been customarily received by the candidate prior to the beginning of the election cycle; and gifts from lotteries and similar legal games of chance. *Id.* § 100.33(b).

MUR 8047 (Charles Gray, *et al.*) Factual and Legal Analysis Page 6 of 7

- 1 permit his name to be used to effect such a contribution, and no person shall knowingly accept a
- 2 contribution made by one person in the name of another person."25
- Furthermore, candidates for the House of Representatives are required to file financial
- 4 disclosure reports with the Clerk of the House of Representatives.²⁶ According to the House
- 5 Committee on Ethics, candidates are not required to disclose, in the assets section of the report,
- 6 loans owed to the candidate if no interest is being charged.²⁷ In addition, candidates are not
- 7 required to disclose, in the transactions section of the report, bequests or inheritances.²⁸ Thus, a
- 8 candidate may loan his principal campaign committee the proceeds from a bequest or inheritance
- 9 without disclosing either event on a financial disclosure report.

Here, the available facts indicate that the source of the funds underlying the \$298,318 in

candidate loans to the Committee were from Gray's personal funds. According to the Response,

Gray received \$250,000 in 2017 from the liquidation of a trust.²⁹ Gray then received \$550,000

between May 28, 2021, and June 1, 2021, from the liquidation of his grandfather's testamentary

estate according to his grandfather's will.³⁰ Because the liquidation of the trust occurred before

Gray became a candidate, and Gray's receipt of the \$550,000 was pursuant to a bequest, both are

considered his personal funds.³¹ Although Gray did not report receiving a \$550,000 inheritance

13

14

15

16

²⁵ 52 U.S.C. § 30122; see also 11 C.F.R. § 110.4(b).

²⁶ 5 U.S.C. § app. 4 § 101(c).

Financial Disclosure Statements and Periodic Transaction Reports, H.R. COMM. ON ETHICS at 22 (2021), https://ethics.house.gov/sites/ethics.house.gov/files/documents/FINAL%20201%20FD%20Instructions_0.pdf ("Loans to a campaign committee must be disclosed if interest is being charged, including those situations where the interest is being passed through the filer to a bank or other financial institution"); id. at 24 (providing that "[d]ebts owed to you for which you are not charging interest" are not required to be disclosed).

²⁸ *Id.* at 29.

²⁹ Resp. at 2.

³⁰ *Id.* at 3.

³¹ See 11 C.F.R. § 100.33(a), (b)(3).

MUR 8047 (Charles Gray, *et al.*) Factual and Legal Analysis Page 7 of 7

- 1 from his grandfather in either his August 13, 2021, or May 16, 2022 House financial disclosure
- 2 reports,³² he was not required to do so according to the guidance issued by the House Ethics
- 3 Committee.³³ To the extent that Gray's assets as disclosed did not appear to encompass the
- 4 \$298,318 he loaned to the Committee, the assets as reported only reflect Gray's assets after he
- 5 made the loans.³⁴ Moreover, the loans were not required to be disclosed on the House financial
- 6 disclosure reports as he did not charge the Committee any interest.³⁵
- 7 Because the available evidence indicates that Gray used his personal funds to loan the
- 8 Committee \$298,318, and there is no evidence to the contrary, the Commission finds: (1) no
- 9 reason to believe that Gray violated 52 U.S.C. § 30122 or 11 C.F.R. § 110.4 by permitting his
- name to be used to effect contributions in the name of another or 52 U.S.C. § 30116(f) or
- 11 C.F.R. § 110.9 by knowingly accepting excessive contributions; (2) no reason to believe that
- the Committee violated 52 U.S.C. § 30122 or 11 C.F.R. § 110.4 by knowingly accepting
- contributions made in the name of another or 52 U.S.C. § 30116(f) or 11 C.F.R. § 110.9 by
- knowingly accepting excessive contributions; and (3) no reason to believe that Jan Charles Gray
- violated 52 U.S.C. § 30122 or 11 C.F.R. § 110.4 by making contributions in the name of another
- or 52 U.S.C. § 30116(a) or 11 C.F.R. § 110.1(b) by making excessive contributions.

Financial Disclosure Report, CLERK OF H.R. (May 16, 2022), https://disclosures-clerk.house.gov/public_disc/financial-pdfs/2022/10048920.pdf (reflecting Gray's reported income from January 1, 2021, through April 30, 2022, and assets as of April 30, 2022); Financial Disclosure Report, CLERK OF H.R. (Aug. 13, 2021), https://disclosures-clerk.house.gov/public_disc/financial-pdfs/2021/10039676.pdf (reflecting Gray's reported income from January 1, 2020, through July 20, 2021, and assets as of July 20, 2021).

Financial Disclosure Statements and Periodic Transaction Reports, H.R. COMM. ON ETHICS at 29 (2021), https://ethics.house.gov/sites/ethics.house.gov/files/documents/FINAL%202021%20FD%20Instructions 0.pdf.

Supra note 32. In addition, Gray reported having a total of \$146,006 to \$416,000 in assets as of July 20, 2021, which could encompass the \$298,318 in loans that he made to the Committee.

³⁵ Supra notes 10, 27.