

Received Electronically by Commission on October 15, 2019

# BakerHostetler

Baker&Hostetler LLP

Washington Square, Suite 1100  
1050 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20036-5403

T 202.861.1500  
F 202.861.1783  
www.bakerlaw.com

E. Mark Braden  
direct dial: 202.861.1504  
MBraden@bakerlaw.com

October 15, 2019

**CONFIDENTIAL**

**VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

Federal Election Commission  
Attn: Saurav Ghosh  
1050 First Street, NE  
Washington, DC 20463

Re: MUR #7351, *Common Cause v. Cambridge Analytica, et al.*  
MUR #7357, *Campaign Legal Center, et al v. John Bolton Super PAC*  
MUR #7382, *Wayne Goodwin v. Senator Thom Tillis, et al.*

Dear Mr. Ghosh:

We represent the John Bolton Super PAC and Cabell Hobbs, Treasurer, John Bolton Super PAC (collectively “Bolton”) in the above-referenced matters. On July 24, 2019, the Commission found reason to believe that Bolton violated 52 U.S.C. § 30121, a provision of the Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971, as amended (“the Act”), and the Commission’s regulations at 11 C.F.R. § 110.20(i), by allegedly allowing foreign nationals to directly or indirectly participate in the management or decision-making process in connection with the John Bolton Super PAC’s election-related activities. The Commission subsequently notified Bolton of its findings, posed additional questions and sought production of certain documents and other information in a letter dated August 1, 2019 (the “Notification Letter”) with accompanying Questions and Document Requests and Factual and Legal Analysis. Bolton responds as follows:

Atlanta Chicago Cincinnati Cleveland Columbus Costa Mesa Denver  
Houston Los Angeles New York Orlando Philadelphia Seattle Washington, DC

October 15, 2019

Page 2

## **I. Introduction and Background**

Former National Security Advisor and United States Ambassador to the United Nations John R. Bolton organized the John Bolton Super PAC to advocate for the election of Senate and House candidates who share his dedication to restoring strong American economic and national security policies.<sup>1</sup> The John Bolton Super PAC seeks a strong, clear, and dependable U.S. national security policy, resting on constancy and resolve.<sup>2</sup> Candidates supported by the John Bolton Super PAC understand the importance of reinvigorating the inherent strength of the American economic system by slashing unnecessary and burdensome Federal regulations and reducing the national debt.<sup>3</sup> Moreover, they understand their profound obligation to restore Ronald Reagan's commitment to "peace through strength" by urgently restoring our military strength and repairing devastating cuts to personnel, weapons, and the defense budget.<sup>4</sup>

Before suspending operations on March 31, 2018, the John Bolton Super PAC used independent expenditures and issue-oriented education to support candidates who demonstrated a commitment to American leadership in a world of growing international threats.<sup>5</sup> The John Bolton Super PAC worked to refocus the national conversation on policies that bolstered the domestic economy and promoted national security.<sup>6</sup> The John Bolton Super PAC aimed to make America's defense and foreign policy a significant factor in the federal elections, but it never contributed directly to candidates, parties or PACs.<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> See Declaration of Sarah Tinsley at ¶2, attached as Exhibit A.

<sup>2</sup> See *id.* at ¶3.

<sup>3</sup> See *id.* at ¶4.

<sup>4</sup> See *id.* at ¶5.

<sup>5</sup> See *id.* at ¶6.

<sup>6</sup> See *id.* at ¶7.

<sup>7</sup> See *id.* at ¶8.

October 15, 2019

Page 3

To execute its strategy, the John Bolton Super PAC retained several vendors that had varying involvement in the activities of the John Bolton Super PAC.<sup>8</sup> Some vendors, such as Campaign Solutions, provided strategic advice to the John Bolton Super PAC in its role as digital and political consultants.<sup>9</sup> Cambridge Analytica,<sup>10</sup> through what now appears to be a subsidiary, SCL USA, was not among the vendors that provided strategic advice to the John Bolton Super PAC.<sup>11</sup> Instead, Cambridge Analytica took on a much smaller role and never actively met with or advised the John Bolton Super PAC or its principals. At no point did Cambridge Analytica or any of its employees participate, directly or indirectly, in the John Bolton Super PAC's management or decision-making process in connection with its election-related activities.<sup>12</sup>

Instead, Cambridge Analytica simply provided predictive data to the John Bolton Super PAC.<sup>13</sup> The John Bolton Super PAC's other vendors then used that data to analyze messages they had already crafted based on the vision laid out by Ambassador John Bolton.<sup>14</sup> Culled and compiled from publicly available information, Cambridge Analytica never prepared lists of voters to target or made recommendations on who, what, when, where, why, or how to target any specific individual. Cambridge Analytica never prepared scripts or content for use by the John Bolton Super PAC. Instead, like the TiVo of old or the Netflix of today, Cambridge Analytica

---

<sup>8</sup> See *id.* at ¶9.

<sup>9</sup> See *id.* at ¶10.

<sup>10</sup> Although the John Bolton Super PAC contracted with SCL USA, we will adopt the definition proposed by the Commission in its Questions and Document Requests: "any reference to Cambridge Analytica means: Cambridge Analytica LLC as well as any parent, subsidiary, or affiliated company – including Cambridge Analytica LTD, SCL Group LTD, SCL Elections, and SCL USA – and any officers, employees, agents, and other persons acting on behalf of Cambridge Analytica LLC or any parent, subsidiary, or affiliated company." Questions and Document Requests, MUR 7351, 7357, and 7383 (John Bolton Super PAC and Cabell Hobbs in his official capacity as treasurer).

<sup>11</sup> See Declaration of Sarah Tinsley at ¶11.

<sup>12</sup> See *id.* at ¶12.

<sup>13</sup> See *id.* at ¶13.

<sup>14</sup> See *id.* at ¶14.

October 15, 2019

Page 4

attempted to determine the preferences of individuals for advertisements based on publicly available characteristics, like Netflix determines the viewing preference of an individual who had just watched Toy Story 1 and Toy Story 2. Just like TiVo and Netflix did not create, write, animate, produce, or act in the Toy Story movies, Cambridge Analytica had no input other than to suggest that Toy Story 3 or The Godfather, Part II might appeal to individuals who purchased Toy Story 1 and The Godfather. Whatever the comparison, and whether the data analytics was provided by a foreign national or an Ohioan, the data analytics professionals at Cambridge Analytica did not direct, dictate, control, or directly or indirectly participate in the decision-making process of the John Bolton Super PAC with respect to any expenditures it made any more than Netflix or TiVo directed, dictated, controlled, or directly or indirectly participated in the creation of Toy Story 3. The bottom line is that the use of a predictive tool run by a computer algorithm is simply not the type of participation by foreign nationals ever contemplated by the statute. If the Commission determines that the use of a computer program coded by foreign nationals equates to participation in election-related activities, then the Commission's rule knows no bounds.

The Complaints against the John Bolton Super PAC should be dismissed.

## **II. Decision to Retain SCL USA as a Data Vendor**

Ambassador John Bolton solely made the decision to retain SCL USA to provide data analytics to Campaign Solutions, the digital and political consultant to the John Bolton Super PAC.<sup>15</sup> Ambassador Bolton became interested in data analytics after reading Sasha Issenberg's book, "The Victory Lab: The Secret Science of Winning Campaigns."<sup>16</sup> After seeking additional

---

<sup>15</sup> See *id.* at ¶15.

<sup>16</sup> See *id.* at ¶16.

October 15, 2019

Page 5

information regarding data analytics, one of the John Bolton Super PAC's donors subsequently recommended hiring SCL USA upon learning of Ambassador Bolton's interest.<sup>17</sup> On or about July 1, 2014, the John Bolton Super PAC entered into a memorandum of understanding with SCL USA to serve as a data vendor under the direction of Campaign Solutions, the digital and political consultants for the John Bolton Super PAC.<sup>18</sup> SCL USA was retained to work with Campaign Solutions, which was the only vendor that actually provided political advice to the John Bolton Super PAC.<sup>19</sup> At no time did the John Bolton Super PAC retain any foreign entity to direct, dictate, control, or directly or indirectly participate in the decision-making process of the John Bolton Super PAC's election-related activities.<sup>20</sup>

Not only did the John Bolton Super PAC not retain any foreign entity, it never paid any foreign entity to direct, dictate, control, or directly or indirectly participate in the decision-making process of the John Bolton Super PAC's election-related activities.<sup>21</sup> SCL USA served as a partner of Cambridge Analytica, an entity also based in New York City, New York.<sup>22</sup> In paying these US-based entities, the Agreement with SCL USA required the John Bolton Super PAC to make payments to Cambridge Analytica, all to City National Bank in Beverly Hills, California.<sup>23</sup> The John Bolton Super PAC made three such payments.<sup>24</sup> At no time did the John Bolton Super PAC send any payment for services to any entity outside the United States or sign any contract with any entity outside the United States.<sup>25</sup>

---

<sup>17</sup> See *id.* at ¶17.

<sup>18</sup> See *id.* at ¶18.

<sup>19</sup> See *id.* at ¶19.

<sup>20</sup> See *id.* at ¶20.

<sup>21</sup> See *id.* at ¶21.

<sup>22</sup> See *id.* at ¶22.

<sup>23</sup> See *id.* at ¶23.

<sup>24</sup> See *id.* at ¶24.

<sup>25</sup> See *id.* at ¶25.

October 15, 2019

Page 6

### III. Cambridge Analytica was a Commercial Vendor

As explained herein, the John Bolton Super PAC hired Cambridge Analytica as a commercial data vendor.<sup>26</sup> Cambridge Analytica provided data analytics to one of the John Bolton Super PAC's vendors, Campaign Solutions, which Campaign Solutions analyzed to see how the messages they crafted might resonate with certain generic personality types.<sup>27</sup> As conceded by the Commission in its Factual and Legal Analysis:

“Commission regulations permit any person or company – foreign or domestic – to provide goods or services to a political committee, without making a contribution, if that person or company does so as a ‘commercial vendor,’ *i.e.*, in the ordinary course of business, and at the usual and normal charge, as long as foreign nationals do not directly or indirectly participate in any committee’s management or decision-making process in connection with its election-related activities.”<sup>28</sup>

Cambridge Analytica’s role was that of a commercial vendor, exactly as described above. Cambridge Analytica provided these data analytics in the ordinary course of business and at the usual and normal charge.<sup>29</sup> As a commercial vendor, Cambridge Analytica provided personality cluster data, which was ultimately analyzed by Campaign Solutions, to better understand how personality types might receive messaging on national security issues.<sup>30</sup> Any direct or indirect participation in political decision-making was done by Campaign Solutions, not Cambridge Analytica.<sup>31</sup> Cambridge Analytica and its employees never directed, dictated, controlled, or directly or indirectly participated, in any management or decision-making process in connection

---

<sup>26</sup> *See id.* at ¶26.

<sup>27</sup> *See id.* at ¶27.

<sup>28</sup> Factual and Legal Analysis at 7, MURs 7351, 7357, and 7383 (John Bolton Super PAC and Cabell Hobbs in his official capacity as treasurer).

<sup>29</sup> *See* Declaration of Sarah Tinsley at ¶28.

<sup>30</sup> *See id.* at ¶29.

<sup>31</sup> *See id.* at ¶30.

October 15, 2019

Page 7

with the John Bolton Super PAC's election-related activities.<sup>32</sup> Cambridge Analytica produced a product and explained how to use it.

In reality, Cambridge Analytica's data resulted in large and unwieldy spreadsheet files, requiring some initial communication from Cambridge Analytica to Campaign Solutions about how Campaign Solutions could interpret and utilize the data. The Commission's suggestion that this provision of user support somehow amounts to direct or indirect participation in a management or decision-making process in connection with the John Bolton Super PAC's election-related activities is unfounded.

The Commission cites MUR 5998 as an example of conduct by a commercial vendor that did not violate the Act.<sup>33</sup> In MUR 5998, the Commission found that the foreign national owners of a venue did not make or facilitate a contribution to a political committee by allowing the committee to rent the venue for a fundraising event, nor did they have any decision-making role in the event.<sup>34</sup> It is clear that the Commission determined that the provision of this venue would have necessarily included explanations by these foreign national owners regarding the venue. It is reasonable to assume that the vendors fielded some questions about the space from the Committee, such as where tables are typically set up or how to use the sound and lighting systems. It is impossible for a Committee to rent out a venue owned by a foreign national, or any other individual, without receiving or requesting information about how the space can be used, or that the provision of such information constitutes participation by the owner in the Committee's decision-making process concerning an election-related activity. The Commission

---

<sup>32</sup> See *id.* at ¶31.

<sup>33</sup> See Factual and Legal Analysis at 7-8, MURs 7351, 7357, and 7383 (John Bolton Super PAC and Cabell Hobbs in his official capacity as treasurer) (citing Factual and Legal Analysis at 4-6, MUR 5998 (Lord Jacob Rothschild)).

<sup>34</sup> See *id.*

October 15, 2019

Page 8

has determined that renting a venue from a foreign national owner is permissible, and a Committee is not required to find an American to field any questions about the venue because such questions do not risk violating the foreign national provision. In a similar manner, when the John Bolton Super PAC purchased data analytics from Cambridge Analytica, the interpretation of the data cannot be a violation of the foreign national prohibition.

The Commission stated that Cambridge Analytica's usual and normal business involved providing data analytics and message targeting services.<sup>35</sup> While Cambridge Analytica may have advertised its services as including message targeting, Cambridge Analytica never performed message targeting services for the John Bolton Super PAC—meaning Cambridge Analytica never determined which individuals to contact or provided any type of list of individuals to either the John Bolton Super PAC or Campaign Solutions. In fact, Cambridge Analytica repeatedly failed to meet its delivery deadlines for data analytics alone.<sup>36</sup> Given that Cambridge Analytica was not even providing data analytics in a timely manner, there is no merit to their “documented admission” that they were “directing the Bolton PAC’s communications decisions.”<sup>37</sup> Cambridge Analytica built its psychographic profiles based on a variety of data sources, including polling to identify receptiveness to national security issues. The only “message testing” performed by Cambridge Analytica regarding the John Bolton Super PAC contract involved polling on statements gathered from Ambassador Bolton’s previous speeches and media appearances, as well as issues that Ambassador Bolton identified and sent to Campaign Solutions. This so-called “message testing” was one data point that contributed to the

---

<sup>35</sup> *See id.* at 9.

<sup>36</sup> *See* Declaration of Sarah Tinsley at ¶32.

<sup>37</sup> Factual and Legal Analysis at 11, MURs 7351, 7357, and 7383 (John Bolton Super PAC and Cabell Hobbs in his official capacity as treasurer); *see also* Declaration of Sarah Tinsley at ¶33.



October 15, 2019

Page 9

personality cluster data prepared by Cambridge Analytica, which was ultimately analyzed by Campaign Solutions.

**III. No SCL USA or Cambridge Analytica Employee Directly or Indirectly Participated in the Management or Decision-Making Process of the John Bolton Super PAC**

In addition to neither retaining nor paying any foreign entity for direct or indirect participation in decision-making regarding election-related activities, no individual at any Cambridge Analytica entity directly or indirectly participated in the management or decision-making process in connection with the John Bolton Super PAC's election-related activities. Instead, Cambridge Analytica's delivery of data analytics was managed on a day-to-day basis by Campaign Solutions.<sup>38</sup>

After entering into the contract with the John Bolton Super PAC, Cambridge Analytica foisted, for a short period, Harris MacLeod, an onsite user support specialist from Cambridge Analytica, on Campaign Solutions in order to facilitate interpretation of the data analytics.<sup>39</sup> The John Bolton Super PAC had no use for MacLeod because there was no indication, or even expectation, that any dedicated individual would be provided for continuous onsite use by Campaign Solutions when the John Bolton Super PAC retained SCL USA.<sup>40</sup> But when Cambridge Analytica foisted MacLeod upon Campaign Solutions, there was no need to question whether he was properly in the United States and able to perform work because all documents in the possession of the John Bolton Super PAC, including the Services Agreement contract ("the contract") between Bolton and SCL USA, indicate that SCL USA was in full compliance with all

---

<sup>38</sup> See Declaration of Sarah Tinsley at ¶34.

<sup>39</sup> See *id.* at ¶35.

<sup>40</sup> See *id.* at ¶36.

October 15, 2019

Page 10

applicable laws and regulations.<sup>41</sup> Even so, no individual at SCL USA or Cambridge Analytica directly or indirectly participated in the management or decision-making process in connection with the John Bolton Super PAC's election-related activities.

Harris MacLeod was, specifically, dispatched by Cambridge Analytica to provide user support to Campaign Solutions to facilitate its use of Cambridge Analytica's data. MacLeod was housed entirely at Campaign Solutions during his tenure, where he provided Campaign Solutions with customer support.<sup>42</sup> Upon information and belief, the John Bolton Super PAC now understands that Harris MacLeod may have been a foreign national, but it has no information on his immigration status. MacLeod's immigration status is ultimately irrelevant, however, because he never participated, directly or indirectly, in any management or decision-making processes in connection with the John Bolton Super PAC's election-related activities. As explained herein, MacLeod was foisted upon Campaign Solutions and essentially functioned as a living instruction manual for how to understand the psychographic cluster data delivered by Cambridge Analytica. Once Campaign Solutions understood how to interpret the data provided to it, MacLeod was no longer needed. MacLeod's role is analogous to the conduct at issue in MUR 6959, cited in the Commission's Factual and Legal Analysis.<sup>43</sup> In MUR 6959, the Commission found no reason to believe that a foreign national violated 52 U.S.C. § 30121 by performing clerical duties, such as online research and translations, during a one month-long internship with a party committee.<sup>44</sup>

---

<sup>41</sup> *See id.* at ¶37.

<sup>42</sup> *See id.* at ¶38.

<sup>43</sup> *See* Factual and Legal Analysis at 8, MURs 7351, 7357, and 7383 (John Bolton Super PAC and Cabell Hobbs in his official capacity as treasurer) (citing Factual and Legal Analysis at 4-5, MUR 6959 (Cindy Nava)).

<sup>44</sup> *See id.*

October 15, 2019

Page 11

Here, MacLeod translated data files into a format that Campaign Solutions could use to understand the personality traits of its audience.

#### **IV. Response to the Commission's Factual and Legal Analysis**

The Commission based its findings on “information provided by internal Cambridge documents,” statements from Christopher Wylie, and statements by unnamed “other foreign national Cambridge employees.”<sup>45</sup> These sources lack credibility, and their statements should be given no weight.

##### **1. Christopher Wylie**

The John Bolton Super PAC has no recollection of ever working with or interacting with a man named Christopher Wylie.<sup>46</sup> Mr. Wylie's salacious accusations are entirely inapplicable to the John Bolton Super PAC. The John Bolton Super PAC had never interacted with, nor even heard of, Christopher Wylie until he began his media crusade to become the self-proclaimed “most important whistleblower since Snowden.”<sup>47</sup> Christopher Wylie has purposely misled the Commission and the Commission's attorneys apparently in order to prolong his fifteen minutes of fame, which he has since parlayed into a book deal. Wylie's accusations regarding the John Bolton Super PAC are baseless. In an interview with the New York Times, Wylie asserted: “[t]he data and modeling Bolton's PAC received was derived from the Facebook data . . . we definitely told them about how we were doing it. We talked about it in conference calls, in

---

<sup>45</sup> *Id.* at 10.

<sup>46</sup> See Declaration of Sarah Tinsley at ¶39.

<sup>47</sup> Parmy Olson, *Facebook's Data-Sharing Was 'Normal,' Says Cambridge Academic at Center of Scandal*, FORBES (Mar. 21, 2018) available at <https://www.forbes.com/sites/parmyolson/2018/03/21/facebook-cambridge-analytica-data-scandal/#2c57567d50fd>.

October 15, 2019

Page 12

meetings.”<sup>48</sup> It is unclear who exactly Wylie is referring to when he says “we,” since he never met or interacted with anyone at the Bolton Super PAC. Campaign Solutions, which managed the day-to-day activities of Cambridge Analytica, has no memory of, and no records indicating, that they spoke to or interacted with Mr. Wylie. Wylie has also stated that “the Bolton PAC was obsessed with how America was becoming limp wristed and spineless and it wanted research and messaging for national security issues . . . that really meant making people more militaristic in their worldview[.] That’s what they said they wanted, anyway.”<sup>49</sup> This statement does nothing to bolster Wylie’s credibility. The only thing this proves is that Wylie knows how to do a Google search. Ambassador Bolton’s views on national security are widely publicized. Wylie’s suggestion that Ambassador Bolton was somehow taking messaging cues from a group of twenty-something data crunchers is patently absurd and is entirely unsupported by the documents cited by the Commission in its Factual and Legal Analysis.

## **2. Unnamed “other foreign national Cambridge Employees”**

In response to the allegations concerning statements by other, unnamed “foreign national Cambridge employees” in the Commission’s Factual and Legal Analysis, the John Bolton Super PAC offers the following: Cambridge Analytica delivered its data to one of the Super PAC’s vendors, Campaign Solutions. The John Bolton Super PAC’s direct interactions with Cambridge Analytica were largely limited to contract negotiations, email communications regarding deadlines for data deliveries, and occasional progress updates.<sup>50</sup> Outside of those interactions,

---

<sup>48</sup> Matthew Rosenberg, *Bolton Was Early Beneficiary of Cambridge Analytica’s Facebook Data*, N.Y. TIMES (Mar. 23, 2018) available at <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/03/23/us/politics/bolton-cambridge-analyticas-facebook-data.html>.

<sup>49</sup> *Id.*

<sup>50</sup> See Declaration of Sarah Tinsley at ¶40.

October 15, 2019

Page 13

employees of the John Bolton Super PAC interacted only minimally with Harris MacLeod, who provided user support to Campaign Solutions, Mark Gettleson, who flew in once for a meeting regarding the initial data, and Alexander Nix, who functioned as a salesman for Cambridge Analytica's data sets.<sup>51</sup>

Unless this unnamed Cambridge employee is Harris MacLeod, it is unlikely that the individual relied upon by the Commission could provide any firsthand knowledge of the interactions between Cambridge Analytica and Campaign Solutions. MacLeod was also likely the main contributor to the 2014 marketing report discussed below, which provided a wildly inaccurate description of his work providing data to Campaign Solutions for the John Bolton Super PAC, therefore undermining his credibility.

Contrary to the self-serving puff piece cited to by the Commission, Harris MacLeod provided Campaign Solutions with user support to facilitate application of Cambridge Analytica's research and data. Campaign Solutions utilized the data provided by Cambridge Analytica to support its messaging and ad concepts, which were created by Campaign Solutions and its U.S. media partners – Poolhouse Digital, a digital advertising agency, and Harbinger Outreach, an experiential marketing agency. MacLeod functioned as a client services coordinator who helped individuals at Campaign Solutions understand what the psychographic cluster data meant. Finding a spot for MacLeod during his visit was like a game of hot potato, and MacLeod spent a great deal of effort trying to justify his time there.

---

<sup>51</sup> See *id.* at ¶41.

October 15, 2019

Page 14

### **3. “Internal Cambridge Documents”**

The “internal Cambridge documents” cited by the Commission in its Factual and Legal Analysis consist of a 2014 marketing report generated by Cambridge Analytica that grossly exaggerates the work it performed for the John Bolton Super PAC.<sup>52</sup> This document is pure puffery, designed to entice prospective clients with buzzwords and exaggerated descriptions of work product. It makes sense, however, that Cambridge Analytica would inflate its importance in order to attract additional clients. Further, Cambridge Analytica took credit for work solely performed by Campaign Solutions and its U.S. media partners. Cambridge Analytica is a data company. They may have tried to promote an expanded array of services, but the only services utilized by the John Bolton Super PAC were for data analytics.

---

<sup>52</sup> Factual and Legal Analysis at 10, MURs 7351, 7357, and 7383 (John Bolton Super PAC and Cabell Hobbs in his official capacity as treasurer).

October 15, 2019  
Page 15

October 15, 2019  
Page 16



October 15, 2019  
Page 17

October 15, 2019  
Page 18

## **VI. Conclusion**

Throughout his decorated career, Ambassador Bolton has demonstrated that he is an independent thinker who is not interested in pandering to any individual. He stands firm in his beliefs and has focused his efforts on restoring strong American economic and national security. Ambassador Bolton alone identified key issues, dictated the Super PAC's messaging and

October 15, 2019

Page 19

advertising medium, and determined the budget for Super PAC expenditures. Cambridge Analytica was not developing the messaging for the John Bolton Super PAC, or even indirectly participating in any messaging development. Instead, Cambridge Analytica was providing psychographic cluster data to Campaign Solutions, in response to a request for said data for voters in a specific state. At no time did MacLeod or any other employee of Cambridge Analytica directly or indirectly advise Ambassador Bolton or the John Bolton Super PAC, nor did they participate in any of the Super PAC's management or decision-making process in connection with its election-related activities. Ambassador Bolton determined the target audience for communications: he chose the states, the budgets, and the ad topics, and tasked Campaign Solutions with creating ad scripts that were ultimately reviewed, revised, and approved by Ambassador Bolton. The allegations in the Commission's Factual and Legal Analysis are entirely unsupported.

For the foregoing reasons, the Complaints should be dismissed, and the Commission should take no further action.

Sincerely,



E. Mark Braden

Attachment

# EXHIBIT A

**BEFORE THE  
FEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION**

Declaration of Sarah Tinsley

I, Sarah Tinsley, declare under penalty of perjury that the following is true and accurate.

1. I am the Director of the John Bolton Super PAC. My business address is 1730 M Street, NW, Suite 611, Washington, DC 20036. The statements in this declaration are based upon my personal knowledge.
2. Former National Security Advisor and United States Ambassador to the United Nations John R. Bolton organized the John Bolton Super PAC to advocate for the election of Senate and House candidates who share his dedication to restoring strong American economic and national security policies.
3. The John Bolton Super PAC seeks a strong, clear, and dependable U.S. national security policy, resting on constancy and resolve.
4. Candidates supported by the John Bolton Super PAC understand the importance of reinvigorating the inherent strength of the American economic system by slashing unnecessary and burdensome Federal regulations and reducing the national debt.
5. Moreover, they understand their profound obligation to restore Ronald Reagan's commitment to "peace through strength" by urgently restoring our military strength and repairing devastating cuts to personnel, weapons, and the defense budget.
6. Before suspending operations on March 31, 2018, the John Bolton Super PAC used independent expenditures and issue-oriented education to support candidates who demonstrated a commitment to American leadership in a world of growing international threats.

7. The John Bolton Super PAC worked to refocus the national conversation on policies that bolstered the domestic economy and promoted national security.
8. The John Bolton Super PAC aimed to make America's defense and foreign policy a significant factor in the federal elections, but it never contributed directly to candidates, parties or PACs.
9. To execute its strategy, the John Bolton Super PAC retained several vendors that had varying involvement in the activities of the John Bolton Super PAC.
10. Some vendors, such as Campaign Solutions, provided strategic advice to the John Bolton Super PAC in its role as digital and political consultants.
11. Cambridge Analytica, through what now appears to be a subsidiary, SCL USA, was not among the vendors that provided strategic advice to the John Bolton Super PAC.
12. At no point did Cambridge Analytica or any of its employees participate, directly or indirectly, in the John Bolton Super PAC's management or decision-making process in connection with its election-related activities.
13. Instead, Cambridge Analytica simply provided predictive data to the John Bolton Super PAC.
14. The John Bolton Super PAC's other vendors then used that data to analyze messages they had already crafted based on the vision laid out by Ambassador John Bolton.
15. Ambassador John Bolton solely made the decision to retain SCL USA to provide data analytics to Campaign Solutions, the digital and political consultant to the John Bolton Super PAC.
16. Ambassador Bolton became interested in data analytics after reading Sasha Issenberg's book, "The Victory Lab: The Secret Science of Winning Campaigns."

17. After seeking additional information regarding data analytics, one of the John Bolton Super PAC's donors subsequently recommended hiring SCL USA upon learning of Ambassador Bolton's interest.
18. On or about July 1, 2014, the John Bolton Super PAC entered into a memorandum of understanding with SCL USA to serve as a data vendor under the direction of Campaign Solutions, the digital and political consultants for the John Bolton Super PAC.
19. SCL USA was retained to work with Campaign Solutions, which was the only vendor that actually provided political advice to the John Bolton Super PAC.
20. At no time did the John Bolton Super PAC retain any foreign entity to direct, dictate, control, or directly or indirectly participate in the decision-making process of the John Bolton Super PAC's election-related activities.
21. Not only did the John Bolton Super PAC not retain any foreign entity, it never paid any foreign entity to direct, dictate, control, or directly or indirectly participate in the decision-making process of the John Bolton Super PAC's election-related activities.
22. SCL USA served as a partner of Cambridge Analytica, an entity also based in New York City, New York.
23. In paying these US-based entities, the Agreement with SCL USA required the John Bolton Super PAC to make payments to Cambridge Analytica, all to City National Bank in Beverly Hills, California.
24. The John Bolton Super PAC made three such payments.
25. At no time did the John Bolton Super PAC send any payment for services to any entity outside the United States or sign any contract with any entity outside the United States.
26. The John Bolton Super PAC hired Cambridge Analytica as a commercial data vendor.


27. Cambridge Analytica provided data analytics to one of the John Bolton Super PAC's vendors, Campaign Solutions, which Campaign Solutions analyzed to see how the messages they crafted might resonate with certain generic personality types.
28. Cambridge Analytica provided these data analytics in the ordinary course of business and at the usual and normal charge.
29. As a commercial vendor, Cambridge Analytica provided personality cluster data, which was ultimately analyzed by Campaign Solutions, to better understand how personality types might receive messaging on national security issues.
30. Any direct or indirect participation in political decision-making was done by Campaign Solutions, not Cambridge Analytica.
31. Cambridge Analytica and its employees never directed, dictated, controlled, or directly or indirectly participated, in any management or decision-making process in connection with the John Bolton Super PAC's election-related activities.
32. In fact, Cambridge Analytica repeatedly failed to meet its delivery deadlines for data analytics alone.
33. Given that Cambridge Analytica was not even providing data analytics in a timely manner, there is no merit to their "documented admission" that they were "directing the Bolton PAC's communications decisions."
34. Cambridge Analytica's delivery of data analytics was managed on a day-to-day basis by Campaign Solutions.
35. After entering into the contract with the John Bolton Super PAC, Cambridge Analytica foisted, for a short period, Harris MacLeod, an onsite user support specialist from



Cambridge Analytica, on Campaign Solutions in order to facilitate interpretation of the data analytics.

36. The John Bolton Super PAC had no use for MacLeod because there was no indication, or even expectation, that any dedicated individual would be provided for continuous onsite use by Campaign Solutions when the John Bolton Super PAC retained SCL USA.
37. But when Cambridge Analytica foisted MacLeod upon Campaign Solutions, there was no need to question whether he was properly in the United States and able to perform work because all documents in the possession of the John Bolton Super PAC, including the Services Agreement contract (“the contract”) between Bolton and SCL USA, indicate that SCL USA was in full compliance with all applicable laws and regulations.
38. MacLeod was housed entirely at Campaign Solutions during his tenure, where he provided Campaign Solutions with customer support.
39. The John Bolton Super PAC has no recollection of ever working with or interacting with a man named Christopher Wylie.
40. The John Bolton Super PAC’s direct interactions with Cambridge Analytica were largely limited to contract negotiations, email communications regarding deadlines for data deliveries, and occasional progress updates.
41. Outside of those interactions, employees of the John Bolton Super PAC interacted only minimally with Harris MacLeod, who provided user support to Campaign Solutions, Mark Gettleson, who may have flown in once for a meeting regarding the initial data, and Alexander Nix, who functioned as a salesman for Cambridge Analytica’s data sets.

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

By:   
Sarah Tinsley  
Director  
John Bolton Super PAC

Dated: October 15, 2019