



FEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20463

MAY 13 2008

Paul E. Sullivan, Esq.  
Sullivan & Associates, PLLC  
800 Springdale Road  
Great Falls, VA 22066-2902

RE: MURs 4568, 4633, 4634, 4736 and 5294  
Robert Riley, Jr.,  
Bob Riley for Congress Committee and  
Hughel Goodgame, as treasurer  
Honorable Robert Riley

Dear Mr. Sullivan:

This is to advise you that the files in MURs 4568, 4633, 4634, and 4736 have been closed and these matters are now public. The Commission previously severed portions of MURs 4568, 4633, 4634 and 4736, placed them into a new matter designated MUR 5294, and closed MUR 5294. Documents related to the cases will be placed on the public record within 30 days. *See* Statement of Policy Regarding Disclosure of Closed Enforcement and Related Files, 68 Fed. Reg. 70, 426 (Dec. 18, 2003). A copy of the dispositive memorandum is enclosed for your information.

If you have any questions, please contact me at (202) 694-1650.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Susan L. Lebeaux". The signature is written in a cursive style.

Susan L. Lebeaux  
Assistant General Counsel

Enclosure:  
As stated



FEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION

Washington, DC 20463

RECEIVED  
FEDERAL ELECTION  
COMMISSION  
SECRETARIAT

2007 AUG 29 A 10:16

AUG 29 2007

**SENSITIVE**

**MEMORANDUM**

**TO:** The Commission

**FROM:** Thomasenia P. Duncan  
General Counsel

**BY:** Ann Marie Terzaken ~~AK~~  
Acting Associate General Counsel for Enforcement

Susan L. Lebeaux *SLZ*  
Assistant General Counsel

**RE:** Closure of MURs 4568, 4633, 4634 and 4736 (Carolyn S. Malenick d/b/a/  
Triad Management Services, Inc., et. al)

**ACTIONS RECOMMENDED**

Close the files in MURs 4568, 4633, 4634 and 4736 as to all remaining respondents.

**DISCUSSION**

In any compliance matter in which a civil action is commenced, the Commission is required to make public the files in the underlying enforcement action no later than thirty days from the date on which the Commission notifies the complainant and respondent of the final disposition of the civil action. See 11 C.F.R. § 111.20(c). On June 21, 2002, the Commission filed a lawsuit in federal district court against Carolyn S. Malenick d/b/a Triad Management Services, Triad Management Services, Inc., and Carolyn S. Malenick as corporate officer for violations of 2 U.S.C. §§ 433, 434, 441a(a), 441a(f) and 441b (the "Triad litigation")

Thereafter, the Commission severed other respondents as to whom the files already had been closed in MURs 4568, 4633, 4634 and 4736, and transferred them to newly opened MUR 5294, which was then immediately closed. Consistent with the interim closing procedures applicable at that time, we sent closing letters to the MUR 5294 respondents and complainants. However, placing the materials from MUR 5294 on the public record was delayed, first by a threatened, and then by an actual motion to

**MURs 4568, 4633, 4634 and 4736**  
**Memorandum to the Commission**

1 enjoin disclosure by then counsel for the defendants in the Triad Litigation. The district  
2 court denied the motion in March 2004. We decided at that time, however, to place  
3 MUR 5294 on the public record concurrently with MURs 4568, 4633, 4634 and 4736 at  
4 the end of the litigation, releasing all Triad-related files at the same time, with an  
5 accompanying press release.<sup>1</sup>

6  
7 On July 26, 2005, the district court in the Triad litigation entered an order of final  
8 judgment. The district court held that the defendants violated FECA by failing to register  
9 and report as a political committee beginning in 1996, knowingly accepted excessive and  
10 corporate contributions, and made excessive contributions. The district court awarded  
11 the Commission declaratory and injunctive relief, and ordered Carolyn Malenick to pay a  
12 nominal civil penalty of \$5,000 in monthly installments of \$100 for 50 consecutive  
13 months (due to lack of resources on the part of the defendants), and to comply with a  
14 modified registration and reporting requirement for Triad covering the years 1996-2000.

15  
16 On October 27, 2005, Malenick submitted Triad's disclosure report for 1996-  
17 2000. However, the submission was blatantly incomplete. After giving Malenick several  
18 opportunities to comply with the court's order, the Commission filed a motion to enforce  
19 the final order, which was granted by the district court in May 2006. Malenick submitted  
20 a revised disclosure report for Triad in June 2006 that was deemed acceptable, but then  
21 failed to submit the June civil penalty installment payment.

22  
23  
24 Malenick resumed making civil penalty payments in October  
25 2006, and has been current since that time.

26  
27 Accordingly, it appears that the Triad litigation has reached its final conclusion,  
28 and there is nothing prohibiting the public release of the files in MURs 4568, 4633, 4634  
29 and 4736 once the Commission approves the closing of those files as to all remaining  
30 respondents and the notification letters required by section 111.20(c) are sent. We plan to  
31 publicly release the files in MUR 5294 at the same time, along with a comprehensive  
32 press release covering the resolutions as to all the respondents in these MURs.  
33

<sup>1</sup> The only respondents remaining in MURs 4568, 4633, 4634 and 4736 were Carolyn S. Malenick d/b/a Triad Management Services, Triad Management Services, Inc., and Carolyn S. Malenick as corporate officer ("the Triad Respondents"), because of the pending litigation, and Bob Riley for Congress and its treasurer, Robert Riley and Robert Riley, Jr., pursuant to the terms of a conciliation agreement in which the Commission agreed not to close the files as to them until MURs 4568, 4633, 4634 and 4736 were completely closed.

MURs 4568, 4633, 4634 and 4736  
Memorandum to the Commission

**RECOMMENDATIONS:**

1. Close the files in MURs 4568, 4633, 4634 and 4736 as to all remaining respondents.
2. Approve the appropriate letters.